Council Agenda October 21, 1969

COUNCIL MEMO NO. 1708-69

To: Mayor and City Council

FROM: City Manager

SUBJECT: Status of Review and Recommendations relating to the City

Pay Plan and various employment practices.

As indicated to the Mayor and City Council in prior memoranda, the Administration has been conducting an in-depth analysis of both the pay plan and employment practices, with particular attention being given to those points raised by the employees, by the Citizens Fact Finding Committee, and by the City Council. This report includes recommended action on the City Pay Plan to be taken prior to, but effective on, January 1, 1970, as well as an interim report of improvements in the City employment practices.

Attached is a detailed report covering the points cited above. A summary of the report, with recommendations, is as follows:

- A. Significant effort has been made to satisfy legitimate Sanitation employee grievances and to implement changes recommended by the Citizens Fact Finding Committee. In particular, the Administration notes; initiation of a five day work week; increased minority employment in administrative positions; overtime payment for sanitation division crews which volunteer for additional work once their routes are completed; improvement in field communication and supervision; revision of grievance procedures; construction and improvement of shower and crew room facilities in the 2121 Westwood and North Classen yards; proposed establishment of an 'Employee Field Counselor' to assist the employees in airing and resolving grievances.
- B. The Administration recommends action on the part of the Mayor and City Council to (1) transfer \$10,000 from the Contingency Fund for physical construction and improvements of crew rooms as noted above; (2) authorize an additional position in the City Manager's office to allow the immediate employment of an Employees' Field Counselor to work with employees on an individual and confidential basis, with particular emphasis on communication and improvements in individual working conditions; and (3) amend the current City Pay Plan, effective January 1, 1970 to provide

Council Memo No. 1708-69 October 21, 1969

the following:

- a. Drop and add one pay step to all pay classifications.
- b. Authorize a one-half step "cost of living" increase for City employees to be used only at the discretion of the City Council - first such increment to be January 1, 1970
- c. Increase the longevity base from \$500 to \$525 in Police and Fire Departments and from \$330 to \$345 in all other Departments.

Based on the attached report, it is suggested that the City Council review the recommendations and authorize appropriate resolutions and ordinances for implementation or, if desired, refer same to the Council Finance Committee for detailed review and recommendation.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert H. Oldland City Manager

STATUS AND RECOMMENDED ACTION RE: THE CITY PAY PLAN AND PERSONNEL POLICIES

This is an updated report, with recommendations, of Administrative review of personnel policies and the City pay plan concerning questions raised by the Mayor and City Council, the Citizens Fact Finding Committee and City Employees.

RESPONSE TO EMPLOYEE GRIEVANCES:

- (1) Five Day Work Week since September 2nd the Sanitation Division Division of the Public Works Department has been on a five day work week and the incentive policy of allowing the crews to leave upon completion of the assigned route is still in effect. In addition crews which finish early and work extra on other routes now do so on a voluntary basis and are paid overtime for same.
- (2) Ordinance Revisions as indicated to Council in prior memoranda (August 11th) reviews are currently underway to consider desirability and feasibility of revising and strengthening the refuse ordinance concerning:
 - (a) can placement and enclosures
- (b) types of receptacles for curb side trash pick up.

 The final report and recommendations will be presented to Council on completion of studies.
- (3) Minority Employment There are currently 14 administrative and/or field supervisory positions in the Sanitation Division comprised of one Superintendent, two Sanitation Field Supervisors, One Administrative Assistant, and ten Foremen III's. Of the two Field Supervisors (which is one of the top three positions), one is Negro. The Administrative Assistant position is filled by a Negro. Of the Foremen III's, four are Negroes. Of the remaining personnel, approximately 80% are in a minority group.
- (4) Extra Pay for Higher Class Work It has been a standard practice for men to perform in higher classifications (without the higher pay) for short periods of time in order to be ready and technically trained to accept a promotion. However, based on the opinion that for extended periods of performance in a higher classification, the men assuming that responsibility should be compensated, the existing policy has been changed. The Administration has initiated the policy whereby a man asked to assume a higher position is paid that higher class salary during the performance of that job, so long as the performance in the higher class is:
 - (a) more than three days because of a vacancy
 - (b) more than three days because of extended sick leave
 - (c) vacation of another man
 - (d) other circumstances authorized by the Superintendent.

This policy became effective September 2, 1969 for all departments and divisions including Sanitation, but is restricted to the field operations from the class of Laborer I through Foreman II.

- (5) Immediate Promotions and Pay Since January 1, 1965 it had been the policy of the City to allow promotions only upon a beginning payroll date such as August 1 or 16. However, since the need for full crews is so important, implementation of immediate promotions, regardless of the time of month, was effected September 2nd in the Sanitation Division. Implementation of immediate promotions and resultant faster filling of vacancies for other Departments and Divisions will also be programmed along with the new computer system.
- (6) Five Man Crews The load packer units now in operation are designed to accommodate only three men. At one time, the larger five man load packer units were used, none of these units exist in the City in service at this time. It is common practice across the country to use three man crews. It is felt that with proper scheduling, a three man crew is the most economical and effective system for the City.
- (7) \$100 per Month Increase in Salary As the Administration has indicated before, current surveys do not indicate justification for a \$100 per month increase in the Sanitation Division job classifications.

The one step pay raise voted September 16th, the proposed one step raise in January, as well as additional pay plan changes recommended elsewhere in this report for the entire employee group will ensure comparability and competitiveness of the existing pay plan. The recommendations also recognize the continuing need for a "cost-of-living" provision in the pay plan administration.

RESPONSE TO THE CITIZENS FACT FINDING COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS:

Concerning the several points raised by the Citizens Fact Finding Committee relating to employment practices, the Administration reports the following:

(A) Showers and lockers be provided - The Administration has inspected the physical facilities at the 2121 Westwood and North Classen crew rooms and has developed a program for improvements as follows:

Sanitation Division:

- 4 shower facilities at North Classen
- 6 shower facilities at Westwood Yard
- 2 exhaust fans each crew room, both locations
- 300 lockers

Street Division:

- 6 shower facilities Westwood Crew Room
- 1 prefab shower closet Westwood Administrative Building
- 4 exhaust fans Westwood Crew Room and Shop
- 265 lockers

The estimated cost for these improvements is as follows:

Shower Rooms: (blocks, plumbing, fixtures, etc.) \$ 800.00 North Classen Crew Room Westwood Sanitation Division Crew Room 900.00 \$ 2,600.00 Westwood Street Division Crew Room 900.00 Lockers: 36 H x 16 W x 24 D Sheetmetal 565 @ 9.45 each 5,339.25 Exhaust Fans 8-18" @ 139.95 each 1,119.60 TOTAL COST \$ 9,058.85

The Facilities Maintenance Division of the Public Works Department is in the process of making related improvements, in addition to the above, to the crew rooms and shower facilities.

The Administration requests and recommends transfer of \$10,000 from the contingency account to fund these improvements.

With respect to the various recommendations relating to the Grievance Procedures, needed improvement in communication and related improvements in employee practices within the various City Departments and Divisions, the following is submitted:

- (B) Grievance Procedure Revisions as authorized the City Manager will adopt and initiate the following Grievance Board and Procedures revisions.
 - (a) The Grievance Review Board be increased from five to eight members with seven voting members

 Elected Employees (non-supervisory) (4)

 Manager's Office Representative (1)

 Municipal Counselor (1)

 Finance Director (1)

 Personnel Director (non-voting) (1)

This reconstitution will provide for increased participation of the non-supervisory employee group and will allow the Personnel Director to act as an advisor both to the Board and the grievant.

- (b) Grievance Procedure Revisions to include adding an additional step. The amended procedure reads as follows:
- Step 1. An employee shall first discuss a grievance with his immediate supervisor in an attempt to reach a satisfactory solution. In this step, it is not

mandatory that the grievance be written. The supervisors are encouraged to counsel with the employee and with their superiors or the Personnel Director in their review and handling of the situation. The Supervisor's decision shall be orally made to the employee within two (2) working days. The majority of grievances should be resolved at this step.

- Step 2. A grievance not satisfactorily resolved in Step 1, may then be orally presented to the employee's Appointing Authority. The Appointing Authority is normally a Department Head. The Appointing Authority shall review the grievance, discuss it with all concerned, and render his decision in writing within three (3) working days to the employee, directing a copy to the Grievance Review Board.
- Step 3. (NEW) A grievance not satisfactorily resolved in Step Two may then be made in writing to the Personnel Director within three working days from the receipt of the written decision of the appointing authority (Department Head). The Personnel Director shall conduct an investigation including the interviewing of both parties and make an effort to reconcile the parties involved within ten working days after the complaint has been filed. A recommendation for reconciliation shall be made to the parties in writing. The complainant not satisfied with the recommended action may appeal to the Grievance Review Board within three working days of receipt of the Personnel Director's recommendation.
- Step 4. Grievances not resolved in Steps 1, 2, or 3 may be submitted in writing, (see attached form "Employee Grievance"), by the employee to the Grievance Review Board within three (3) working days.

Board members shall not serve in a review capacity in grievances concerning employees under their supervision. In the event that a grievance from an employee under a Board Member's supervision or from the same department is to be heard by the Board, the City Manager shall appoint a replacement for that hearing only.

The Board shall review grievances and the Secretary shall provide those concerned with its conclusion within five (5) working days. The Board shall review grievances, receive testimony and evidence of the parties and provide a report of its findings and recommendations to the City Manager. The Review Board's conclusion and decisions, as approved by the City Manager, shall have the power of affirmation, denial or modifications of the decision of the appointing authority.

- Step 5. An employee not satisfied with Step 4 decision may request the Personnel Director to submit his grievance within three (3) working days to the City Manager. The City Manager may affirm, deny, or modify the decision of the Review Board within five (5) working days from the appeal. The City Manager's decision shall be final.
- (C) Addition of an Employee Field Counselor As a result of reviews of employee problems it has been determined that improved field counseling services are needed.

Field counseling is needed for all employees on an informal and confidential basis. The field counselor would set up locations and times in the field so that employees could be heard in confidence and without fear of jeopardizing their employment.

The primary function of the Employee Field Counselor would be:

- (1) To provide counseling and assistance to employees in Grievance Procedure.
- (2) Protect employee interests.
- (3) To provide a direct contact between employees and management.

No attempt is to be made by the Employee Field Counselor to circumvent the authority of the supervisor, division or department head. The Counselor will be directly responsible to the City Manager and will provide assistance to employee problems, answer questions, report unusual problems to the City Manager's office, and generally provide the type of assistance that will help identify and suggest corrective measures to employee problems before they become major problems.

The employee counselor will act in a staff capacity and will be available to assist division and department staff personnel to initiate corrective measure within the respective divisions and/or departments when same is warranted.

In order to meet this need it is the Administration's recommendation that the City Council authorize one (1) additional staff position in the City Manager's Department. The classification to be that of "Employee Field Counselor" - Salary Range 220 (\$600 - \$750). It is further recommended that the position be filled as quickly as possible. The budget effect of this recommendation for the remainder of FY 69-70 would be approximately \$4,200.00 which can be paid from the contingency fund.

- (D) Retirement Contribution Changes. Due to the turnover of employees within the first year of service and in view of the fact that the tirst six months of employment are probationary, the Administration recommends that retirement contributions not be withheld from employees pay for the first six months of service. Once the probationary period is completed (at the end of six months) retirement contributions would be withheld and benefits accrued from that date.
- (E) Review of Rehire Policy. The Administration would note that since the August 19 walkout by some members of the Sanitation Division, efforts have been made to recruit and fill the resulting vacancies. A policy of reinstatement to those terminated for walk out activity has been established and to date 128 Sanitation workers have been reinstated. Over all, the Sanitation Division has filled needed vacancies from the following sources:

Remained on the job	35	
Reinstated	113	
New Hires	68	
Transfers	3	219

Due to normal turnover there was a total of 219 Sanitation employees working as of October 20th. Sanitation Division manpower allocation prior to the strike, and as of October 20th are as follows:

	Prior to 8/19/69	As of 10/20/69
Drivers	82	81
Collector II	84	32
Collector I	118	106
Vacancies		65
	284	284

Efforts are continuing by way of individual contact, recruiting trips and advertising to fill all remaining vacant positions so that twice-a-week pickups can be restored.

RECOMMENDED PAY PLAN REVISIONS

After careful review of the existing pay plan and in light of suggestions and recommendations made by the City Council and the Fact Finding Committee, the Administration recommends several improvements and changes to the existing pay plan.

Several points and developments bear on these proposed recommendations; in particular, the Administration points to past action by the City Council and recent developments in the City of Tulsa.

A review of past City Council pay actions and the additional costs thereof occurring since July 1, 1968 through the latest action effective September 16, 1969 are listed below:

Date	No. of Employees	Reason	Additional Annual Cost
July 1, 1959	3,038	PAS Adjustment	\$2,221,758
January 1, 1969	3,191	Advanced 7/1/69 raise plus selected up-grading	957, 192
July 1, 1969	1,441	Longevity extended to all personnel plus selected up-grading	406,949
Sept. 16, 1969	2,283	Citizen's Fact Finding Committee Report & Resultant Council Action	729,960

TULSA PAY ACTIONS

We have reviewed our current pay plan in light of recent actions by Tulsa, Oklahoma, which revised their pay plan as tollows:

All employees except Fire and Police:

In addition to a programmed increase of one step as of 1/1/70:

Effective 10/1/69

\$25 per month

Effective 1/1/70

\$10 per month

(The \$35 per month to be added to beginning step and to top step of existing pay ranges)

Fire and Police Employees:

In addition to a programmed increase of one step as of 1/1/70:

Effective 10/1/69

\$30 per month

Effective 1/1/70

\$30 per month

(The \$60 per month to be added to the beginning step and to top step of existing pay ranges)

Fire and Police new range effective 1/1/70:

\$542 beginning

\$667 maximum

PAY PLAN RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on available data relating to the local job market, prevailing wage scales and levels of pay in comparable cities, the Administration has suggested revisions which will maintain the effectiveness of the Pay Plan:

- (1) The programmed one-step pay raise for January 1, 1970 to remain in effect.
- (2) The current minimum step be dropped and a new maximum step be added to all pay ranges.
- (3) A mid-step cost of living provision be added to the City Pay Plan (each mid-step to be one-half (1/2) of a regular pay step). Mid-steps will be effective only upon approval by the City Council and only for the purpose of meeting cost of living increases. The first such mid-step to be effective January 1, 1970 along with any authorized merit increase of one step programmed for January 1, 1970.
- (4) That the longevity pay base be increased by amending the longevity ordinance to reflect the dropping of the current minimum step as follows:

Fire & Police (uniformed)

From \$500/month to \$525/month From \$330/month to \$345/month The proposal to delete and add one pay step to all pay ranges, increasing all entry levels by one pay step, will ensure the competitiveness of the pay scale and should improve the City's ability to recruit from local manpower sources. This proposal reflects the second such amendment to the pay plan since July of 1968 - the last being on January 1, 1969.

The proposal to make provisions for a 2 1/2% cost of living increase in the pay plan will, in the opinion of the Administration, greatly strengthen the pay plan. As was pointed out by the Citizens Fact Finding Committee, there is currently no cost of living provision in the pay plan. The current salary ranges are based on 5% step increments and are intended to be merit raises only. Thus under existing conditions, in a period of increased cost of living, the real income tends to remain constant where pay increases are, in part, used to defray additional cost of living. Inclusion of the 2 1/2% cost of living provision, plus the 5% merit increase would satisfy this problem and greatly affect the use of a merit pay system. Thus the merit provisions of the pay plan (5% increments) could be programmed and budgeted annually, and cost of living increases used by Council at their discretion to compensate for increases in living cost based on annual or semi-annual reviews.

The Administration proposes administration of this cost of living increment as follows:

- (1) The increase would apply to all employees regardless or length or service.
- (2) Only the City Council could authorize same. And when same is approved by the Council, all pay ranges would increase by 2 1/2% or one-halt pay step.
 - (3) The first such increment be programmed for January 1, 1910.
- (4) Upon adoption of the cost of living increase the entry level for all pay classifications will increase by one-half step. All new personnel will then start at step AA.

With the addition of a fixed cost of living provision, the City pay plan would be among the most equitable and would be comparable with similar provisions in private industry. This, plus longevity and merit increases, should allow the City to recruit and pay competitive wages.

This time table below illustrates the effect of this proposal compared with the PAS recommendations of 7/1/68 for selected classifications. In addition, attached is a computer run of the proposed pay ranges for selected classifications showing the effect of the 2 1/2% cost of living increase and the dropping and adding of one pay step for all pay ranges.

EXAMPLES OF EFFECT OF PAY CHANGES ON SELECTED CLASSIFICATIONS SINCE JULY 1, 1968:

					(6)	% Increase Min-Max
	Prior to	(1)	(2)	(3)(4)(5)	proposed	7/1/68 -
	7/1/68	7/1/68	1/1/69	9/16/69	1/1/70	1/1/70
Refuse Collector I	300-330	345-380	360-420		390-450	30%-36%
Refuse Collector II	300-330	360-400	380-440	see	410-470	36%-42%
Refuse Truck Driver	345-375	400-480	420-500	note	450-537	30%-43%
				below		
Laborer I	270-300	315-345	330-360)	352-390	30%-30%
Laborer II	315-345	360-400	380-420)	410-450	30%-30%
Firefighter	405-450	480-575	500-630)	537-675	33%-50%
Police Officer	425-475	480-575	500-630)	537-675	26%-42%

- (1) PAS Study Fire and Police equated
- (2) Advanced 7/1/69 program. Added additional pay range step to Fire, Police and Refuse Collectors I and II
- (3) 7/1/69 Longevity extended to all City employees, moved all Fire and Police Personnel with 5 1/2 years of service in grade up one step
- (4) Citizens Fact Finding Committee report adjustment. No change in range.
- (5) 5% increase within pay range for all employees with 6 months or more of service.
- (6) Current proposal (5% merit increase plus 2 1/2% cost of living adjustment, effective January 1, 1970)

FINANCIAL ANALYSIS

Cost: The additional cost to implement the above recommended changes for the six months of the fiscal year 1969-1970 covering January 1 - June 30, 1970 is as follows:

(1) One Step Pay Increase funded in Current Budget to be effective 1/1/70	\$514,000
(2) Additional cost to implement recommended changes:	
(a) to drop the current minimum and add a new	
maximum step	121,500
(b) to add a mid-step to each step	257,037
(c) to increase longevity base one step	20,750
Additional Cost to implement for six months FY 69-70	\$399,287
Total Cost of 1/1/70 Pay Increase Proposal	\$913,287

Funding: General revenues for the first three months of the fiscal year are \$318,335 ahead of the forecast for that period consisting principally of excess water and sales tax revenues.

Water revenue received in October (September receipts) is \$250,000 in excess of our forecast for that month.

It is recommended that the above mentioned excess in revenues over the forecast be allocated to the various payroll accounts to fund the cost of said pay plan changes:

Revenue excess to date	\$568,335
Pay implementation cost	(399, 287)
Uncommitted Surplus	\$168 048

											PROPO	JAN 1,1970			
JOB CODE & DESCRIPTION	RANG	SE A	AA	В	ВВ	С	cc	D	DD	Ε	EE	F	FF	G	GG
201-ACCOUNT CLERK II 200-ACCOUNT CLERK I 280-ADMINISTRATIVE ASST 796-AIRPORTS DIRECTOR	213 210 220 336	400 630	470.00 410.00 645.00	480 420 660	490.00 430.00 675.00		512.50 450.00 705.00	525 460 720	537.50 470.00 735.00 1450.00	550 480 750	562.50 490.00 767.50	1540	1570.00	1600	1640 00
210-AUDITOR 662-AUTO MECHANIC 651-AUTO SERVICEMAN II 650-AUTO SERVICEMAN I	219 115 111 109	600 500 420 380	615.00 512.50 430.00 390.00	630 525 440 400	645.00 537.50 450.00 410.00	660 550 460 420	675.00 562.50 470.00 430.00	690	705.00	720	735.00	1540	1370400	1000	1040*00
220-BUDGET OFFICER 436-BUILDING INSP DIR 430-BUILDING INSPECTOR	229 335 215	940 1210 500	960.00 1235.00 512.50			1310	1335.00	1360	1092.50 1390.00 587.50			1480	1510.00	1540	1570.00
212-CITY AUDITOR 175-CITY CLERK 122-CLERK III		1025 940		1070	1092.50	1115 1025	1137.50	1160 1070	1185.00 1092.50 490.00	1210	1235.00				
121-CLERK II 120-CLERK I	209	380 345	390.00 352.50	400 360	410.00	420 380	430.00	440 400	450.00	460 420	470.00				
130-CLERK TYPIST I 792-CREW CHIEF 504-CUSTODIAN	208 216 108	360 525 360	370.00 537.50 370.00	380 550 380	390.00 562.50 390.00		410.00 587.50 410.00	600	430.00 615.00	630	450.00 645.00				
355-DRAFTSMAN I 644-EQUIP OPERATOR III 643-EQUIP OPERATOR II	211 216 214	420 525 480	430.00 537.50 490.00	550 500	450.00 562.50 512.50	575	470.00 587.50 537.50		490.00 615.00 562.50	500 630 575	512.50 645.00 587.50				
642-EQUIP OPERATOR I 845-FIREFIGHTER 527-FOREMAN III	212 253 218	440 525 575	450.00 537.50 587.50	460 550 600	470.00 562.50 615.00	575	587.50		512.50 615.00	525 630 690	537.50 645.00 705.00	660	675.00		
526-FOREMAN II 525-FOREMAN I	216 113	525 460	537.50 470.00	550 480	562.50 490.00	575 500	587.50 512.50			630	645.00				
511-LABORER II 510-LABORER I 716-PARKS & REC DIR	110 107 333	400 345 1115	410.00 352.50 1137.50	360 1160	430.00 370.00 1185.00	380	390.00	1260	1285.00	1310	1335.00	1360	1390.00	1420	1450.00
305-PERSONNEL DIRECTOR 420-PLANNING DIRECTOR 805-POLICE OFFICER	335	1210	1235.00	1260	1285.00	1310	1335.00	1360	1390,00 1640,00	1420	1450.00	1480 1760	1510.00	1540	1570.00
374-PUB WORK DIR/CITY ENG		-												2040	2090.00

NOTE: SINGLE LETTER STEPS ARE THE BASIC PAY PLAN PROGRAM.

DOUBLE LETTER STEPS ARE 1/2 OF A BASIC PAY PLAN STEP IN SEQUENCE AND REPRESENT COST OF LIVING ADJUSTMENTS ONLY UPON APPROVAL OF THE CITY COUNCIL.

Buse							PRO						DSED JAN 1,1970				
	JOB CODE & DESCRIPTION	RANG	E A	AA	В	ВВ	С	СС	D	DD	E	EE	F	FF	6	GG	
	840-RANGER 516-REFUSE COLLECTOR II 515-REFUSE COLLECTOR I 518-REFUSE TRUCK DRIVER 478-SANITATION FIELD SUPV 110-STORES CLERK	213 152 151 212 220 209	460 400 380 440 630 380	470.00 410.00 390.00 450.00 645.00	480 420 400 460 660 400	490.00 430.00 410.00 470.00 675.00	500 440 420 480 690 420	512.50 450.00 430.00 490.00 705.00 430.00	525 460 440 500 720 440	537.50 470.00 450.00 512.50 735.00	550 525 750 460	562.50 537.50 767.50 470.00					
	885-TRAFFIC CONTROL DIR 875-TRAFFIC SIGNAL MAINT 640-TRUCK DRIVER 800-WATCHMAN 776-ZOD DIRECTOR	332 113 110 108	1070 460 400 360	1092.50 470.00 410.00 370.00	1115 480 420 380	1137.50 490.00 430.00 390.00	1160 500 440 400	1185.00 512.50 450.00 410.00 1285.00	1210	1235.00	1260	1285.00					

NOTE: SINGLE LETTER STEPS ARE THE BASIC PAY PLAN PROGRAM.

DOUBLE LETTER STEPS ARE 1/2 OF A BASIC PAY PLAN STEP IN SEQUENCE AND REPRESENT COST OF LIVING ADJUSTMENTS ONLY UPON APPROVAL OF THE CITY COUNCIL.